

Makbûl-i Ârif and a Different Perspective on Language Learning

Hüseyin GÖNEL

International Burch University, Sarajevo

hgonel@ibu.edu.ba

Abstract: Language Learning is a subject that has been popular through the ages. Therefore, a number of methods and techniques were developed and applied on this subject. Today, these studies are still continuing. Referring to the dictionaries is one of these methods. Even in Ottoman society, there were dictionaries written in verse to serve this aim. Dictionaries called *Subha-i Sıbyan*, which enabled primary school students to memorize the words and keep them in mind easily, were widely used. *Sıbha-i Sıbyan* Dictionaries aimed at teaching especially Arabic and Persian. There were also other dictionaries in verse which were designed to teach different languages too. Mehmet Hevai Üsküfi's work *Makbul-i Arif* dedicated to Sultan Murad the 4th. is known as the first Bosnian-Turkish dictionary in verse. This dictionary introduces a different perspective in language learning. As it is easier to memorize and keep in mind, poetry has been more effective in language learning compared to prose. In this study, *Makbul-i Arif* is introduced as an example for the use of dictionaries in verse in language learning.

Key words: Verse dictionary, language education, Makbûl-i Arif

Introduction

Today, in our rapidly globalized world, it has become usual to come across different languages and cultures frequently. There is no doubt that there were those kinds of encounters in the past, too. In terms of cultural differences, language factor is one of the most important of those. Therefore, the initial communication between those different societies has been made possible by language. So, the scholars have been working on different methods of language learning and teaching through the ages. The methods designed and applied on language learning and teaching are comprehensive enough to compile a separate work of art (Demircan, 2005).

Even though the methods applied on language learning are plenty and various, some of them have permanent validity. Those are; learning by association, exemplification, narration, learning in context and by dictionary.

The word-centered methods are especially used widely in language learning. In this method, it is important that the words are easy to keep in mind. One of the widely used methods is learning by association. The method based on the association of the subsequently used words according to their meanings and pronunciations that enables to keep them in mind. In the other method, a little story is made up based on the word. For example; *testimony* is an English word and means *a statement under oath*. The method is applied as follows; Temel commits a murder and was brought to the court. When the judge asks "How did you do that?" he says "kestimoni" (I cut him). The similarity between the sounds *testimony* and *kestimoni* reminds the word. The word can be remembered in this way. There are many dictionaries (Bademcioğlu, 2009) prepared based on those mimi-stories.

This idea has been reflected on the preparation of dictionaries. Generally, in the classical dictionaries, the word is given and the word class and origin follow it. That is followed by the real and metaphorical meaning. Then an example sentence is given. Extra uses affixes are added if necessary. Compound words, adjective and adverb and verb phrases, prepositions and metaphors etc... (Parlatır, 2009; TDK, 2005; Redhouse, 2008).

The Tradition of Verse dictionary

Divan-ı Lüğati't-Türk, designed to show the richness of Turkish vocabulary and to teach Turkish to Arabs, is known as the first Turkish example in case of language learning. This work was followed by many dictionaries and dictionary-like works. By means of the example we introduce in this study, it is useful to mention the tradition of dictionary in verse in language teaching. As it is known, Diwan Literature is mainly based on verse. The poets of the age found the verse more useful than prose. About this, 16th century poetry and verse scholar Lami's

“Nesrdür gerçi dehre sermâye
Dürr-i nazmun-durur velî pâyê”

words and the expression “Nesir raiyyet gibidir ve nazım padişahır” in Kabusnâme are clear enough to explain this (Üzgör, 1990:136; Okuyucu, 2006:74).

Because of preference of verse in Diwan Literature many works were written in verse. Dictionaries in verse ***** were the production of this approach. The means of harmony such as metre and rhyme served to keep the words in mind as well as making the work enjoyable to read. The preparation of dictionaries in verse aimed at contributing language learning.

The old society was a culturally rich and multi-lingual society. Arabic, Persian and Turkish were the leading languages. Arabic was taught in schools and medreses under the influence of religion. The people dealing with poetry and literature used Persian. The common language used in public was Turkish. The other languages were spoken in their local regions. For example; Bosnian in Bosna, Albanian in Albania.

Here, it is useful to mention another tradition in this respect. Independent works in which some complicated contexts were explained were called “Şerh”. The writer who believes he comprehends the subject better than others explains the concepts in this work profoundly. These works are divided into two sections: Grammar Serhs and Tasavvufi Serhs.

The concept about language learning is related to Gramar Şerhs. The word's original and metaphorical meanings are given in these şerhs, the examples of different uses are also added when necessary. The reader both learns the word and the rules of grammar. Although generally written in prose, there are also some şerhs written in verse.

The first examples of dictionaries in verse are in Arab and Persian Literatures. The first examples in Anatolian region are Arabic-Persian *****. Those were followed by Arabic-Turkish dictionaries *****. Some of the dictionaries in verse were written in three languages; Arabic-Persian-Turkish *****. There were also dictionaries in verse written in Bosnian-Turkish, Armenian-Turkish, French-Turkish *****.

The work of art that will be introduced in this article is Makbul-i Arif which was written by Mehmed Hevai Uskufî in 1631 and dedicated to Sultan Murad III.

During the era which started in 1463 with Fatih Sultan Mehmed's invasion of Istanbul, Turkish culture was intensely reflected in Bosna-Hersek. Many notions of social life were restructured in Bosna-Hersek, which

***** “For more information on Verse Dictionaries, refer to Ağah Sırrı Levend, *Divan Edebiyatı Kelimeler ve Remizler Mazmunlar ve Mejhunlar*, İstanbul 1984, s. 636,637; Ahmet Hilmi İmamoğlu, “*Farsça-Türkçe Manzum Sözlükler ve Şahidi'nin Sözlüğü*”, Atatürk Üniversitesi (Unpublished PhD. dissertation), Erzurum; Adnan Karaismailoğlu, “*Manzum Sözlüklerimizden Tuhfe-i Remzî*”, **Millî Kültür**, S. 7, Ankara 1990, s. 60,61.; *Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı Ansiklopedisi*, “*Manzum Lügatler*” C. VI, İstanbul 1986, s.144; Yusuf Öz, *Tarih Boyunca Türkçe-Farsça Sözlükler*, Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü (Unpublished PhD. dissertation), Ankara 1996, s. 52-74; H. Harun Duman, “*Tuhaf Bir Lügat: Miftâh-ı Lisân*”, **Türk Dünyası Araştırmaları**, S. 54, İstanbul 1988, s. 82-88.; Yusuf Öz, *Tuhfe-i Şahidî Şerhleri*, Konya 1999, s.1-21; Ahmet Kartal, “*Ahmet Remzî'nin 'Tuhfe-i Remzî' İsimli Eseri*” **Bilge**, S. 28, Ankara 2000, s. 159-161; Adnan Karaismailoğlu, *Klasik Dönem Türk Şiiri İncelemeleri*, Ankara 2001, s.178-182; Ahmet Kartal, *Ahmet Remzî Efendi Tuhfe-i Remzî (İnceleme-Transkribe Metin- İndeks- Sözlük)*, Ankara 2001, s. 3-28.; Ali Temizel, *Ahmedî'nin Farsça Eserleri Tenkidli Metin-İnceleme-Tercüme ve İndeks*, Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü (Unpublished PhD. dissertation), Ankara 2002, s. 107-276. (Kırbyık, 2002)”

***** “These dictionaries are *Zühretü'l-Edeb*'i, written by Şükrüllâh b.Şemsüddîn Ahmed b. Seyfüddîn Zekeriyâ in H. 640/ M. 1242-3, *Nasibü'l-Fityân ve Nesibü't-Tibyân*, written by Hüsameddin Hasan b. Abdülmü'min el-Hoyî, *Silkü'l-Cevâhir*, prepared in H. 757/ M. 1356, by Abdülhamid el-Engürî, *Mirkatü'l-Edeb*, versed by Germiyanlı Ahmedî between H. 761-779/ M.1360-1377, and *Ukûdu'l-Cevâhir*, by Ahmed-i Dâî (after H. 824/ M.1421) (Kırbyık, 2002)”

***** “First Arabic-Turkish verse dictionary is *Lügat-i Ferišteoğlu*, written by Abdüllatîf İbn-i Melek in H. 795/ M. 1392. Şemsi's *Cevâhirü'l Kelimât*, Şeyh Ahmed's *Nazmu'l-Leâl* published in 1051/1635, Âsım's (date of birth 1755/date of death 1819) *Tuhfe-i Âsım*, completed in H. 1213/ M. 1798, Vehbî's *Nuhbe-i Vehbî*, written in H. 1214/ M.1799, and Mehmed Fevzî's (date of death: 1903) *Tuhfe-i Fevzî*, and Hüsâm b. Hasan el-Konevî's *Tuhfe-i Hüsâmî*, written in H. 802/ M. 1399-1400 (?), are considered to be the first samples of Persian-Turkish verse dictionaries in Anatolia. Besides these works, there are many other works available such as, İbrahim Dede's *Tuhfe-i Şahidî* (date of publication: H. 921 /M. 1515), Lâmi'î Çelebi's *Lügat-i Manzûme* (date of publication: H. 933 / before M. 1527), Sünbülzâde Vehbî's *Tuhfe-i Vehbî* (date of publication: H. 1197 /M. 1782), Süleyman Dürrî's *Güher-rîz* (date of publication: H. 1263 /M. 1867), and Ahmed Remzî Akyürek's *Tuhfe-i Remzî* (date of publication: H. 1343/ M. 1924). (Kırbyık, 2002)”

***** “For example; *U'cubetu'l-Garâyib*, written by Bahâüddin İbn Abdurrahmân-ı Magalkaravî (date of publication: H. 827/ M. 1424), *Lügat-i Abdülkerim*, written by Abdülkerim (date of publication: H. 1002/ M. 1594), *Menâzimu'l-Cevâhir*, by Hâkî Mustafa Üsküdarî (date of publication: H.1042 /M. 1632-3), and Hasan Aynî's *Nazmu'l-Cevâhir* (date of publication: H. 1236/ M. 1821) (Kırbyık, 2002)”

***** “These works are; Bosnalı Üsküfî's Boşnakça-Türkçe *Makbül-i Ârif* (date of publication: H. 1041/M. 1631), Refî'î Kalayî (date of death: 1821)'s *Ermenice Lügati*, Ahmed Fevzî (date of death: 1881)'s Rumca-Türkçe *Tuhfetü'l-Uşşâk*, and Yusuf Hâlis (date of death: 1882)'s Fransızca- Türkçe *Miftâh-ı Lisân* (date of publication: H. 1266/ M. 1850) (Kırbyık, 2002)”

became an important center of Government. Therefore, literary works emerged in 15th century. In Bosnia, Literary movement was developed in two branches. One branch was represented by the poets who wrote in Turkish with Arabic alphabet, the other was represented by the poets who wrote in Bosnian with Arabic alphabet. The second party developed the literature called *Alhamiyado*. Sabina Dizdarević states that *Makbul-i Arif* is considered to be the first example of the Literature called *Alhamiyado* (Okumuş, 2009:824-825).

Muhammed Hevâî Üsküfî and Makbûl-i Ârif

The poet who used Havai and Uskufî nicknames was born in Dobirnya village near Donya Tuzla, a district of Zvornic province, in 1601. He was the son of a Zvornic governor. He served in Ottoman Palace for 20 years. He died in 1651. The poet who knew Arabic and Persian was influenced by *Tuhfe-i Şahidi* of Sahidi İbrahim Dede, who had written a Persian-Turkish dictionary before him. It has the exception of being the first and only verse dictionary written in Bosnian and Turkish. The work is also known as “*Potur Şahidi*” (Okumuş, 2009).

The poet was thinking of creating a work, and he was in search of a style never thought or used before. However, good or bad all the words were exhausted in the world. While thinking, he decided to write a Bosnian dictionary because although a number of works had been created so far, there was no Bosnian-Turkish dictionary written in verse (Hevai, 3a-3b; Korkut, 1942: 386). So, he made up his mind on the type of work he would write.

However, *aruz* metre were used in Diwan Literature. *Aruz* was mainly the metre of Arap poetry. Persians tried to write their poetry with this metre for centuries. Persian language was adjusted to the Persian *aruz* with the introduction of new *aruz* types. Turkish poets experienced the same difficulty. They complained that Turkish was not convenient for *aruz* style until they started to use it successfully (İpekten, 2008: 131-141). The same process was experienced in case of Bosnian too. Mehmed Hevai explains this case in today’s terms: “Just as Bosnian people are huge, their language is huge, too. To adopt this language into *aruz* is as difficult as pulling an iron bow” (Hevai, 4a-5a; Korkut, 1942: 387). However, the poet manages that and completes his work using a simple and fluent language.

The work consists of an introduction and 13 stanzas. At the end of each stanza, there is a *mülemma* couplet consisting of one line Bosnian and one line Turkish. At the end of each section, a metre is given with *takti* couplet. The context is active and the described Turkish and Bosnian words are given the same number.^{††††††††}

The work was published in Sarajevo in 1942 by Derviş M. Korkut. Publication is in three types: Latin, Ottoman and Bosnian alphabets (Korkut, 1942: 371-408). It was also published in 2001 by Fehim Nametak (Nametak, 2001).

The dictionary is a word-centered dictionary. About 650 thousand words were explained (Okumuş, 2009:836). Names and adjectives are the majority in the dictionary. There are also short sample sentences. A lot of words from colloquial language were used. The poet claimed that he wrote the dictionary for Bosnian villagers. Therefore, the words related to farming are the majority. In addition, there are also words related to shopping, days and numbers that are used in daily language. There is a line in the form of a sentence at the end of each poem. In this respect, it reminds the mini-dictionaries of today designed for travelers. It is useful for expressing oneself at a beginner level in a strange country. To give the reader an idea, the first, 9th, and 13th sections of *Makbul-i Arif* were given below:

Part I:

- 1 ***Bog Tanrı jedno bir-dir hem jedini vahdeti***
Duša cân-dir čovik adam dirlugi-dir životi
- 2 ***Hem ferişte ‘andel oldu göklere de nebesi***
Raj cennet rajnik oldu demek cenneti
- 3 ***Moma kız-dir prah toz-dur trag iz-dir put yol***
Zâhide hem sop derler sam-sid-dir halveti
- 4 ***Visoko-dur yüksek olan alçak olan nizko***
Hem sokol-dur şâhin adı uçtu demek poleti

^{††††††††} For more information on the work, refer to Sait OKUMUŞ (2009) Muhammed Hevâî Üsküfî ve Türkçe-Boşnakça Manzum Sözlüğü Makbûl-i Arif, Turkish Studies International Periodical For the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic Volume 4/4 Summer.

- 5 **Glava** baş-tır **zub** diş-dir hem dudağa **usna** der
Nos burun dil **jezik**-dir bre sendir **more ti**
- 6 **Usta** ağız **rame** omuz hem kulağa **uha** der
Čelo alın kaş **obrv'** sen güzelsin **lipo ti**
- 7 Hem ayaga **noga** derler, dize derler **kolino**
Padişaha car derler, **carina**-dır devleti [R-6294:2]
- 8 Gümüşe hem **srebro** derler **zlato** der hem altına
Güzele hem **lipo** derler sana benzer **kano ti**
- 9 Hem tüfeğe **puška** derler **sablja** derler kılıca
Luk yay-dir sırım **kopje** dahi sen vur **udri ti**
- 10 At **konj**-dur **mazga** katır **magare** der eşeğe
Zob yem-dir **sino** otluk al sen de **uzmi ti**
- 11 **Kuća** evdir **žena** avrat **muž** derler kocaya
Dahi kurda **vuk** der, **vučija**-dır heybeti
- 12 Konuğa hem **gost** derler **most** köprü **mast** yağ
Hem bıçaga **nož** derler **meso** dahi bil eti
- 13 **Praz** erkek koç **ovan**-dır hem **ulište**-dir kovan
Sir peñir-dir **med** bal-dir **medovin'**-dir şerbeti
- 14 **List** yaprak **trud** tutarak çakmak adı **ognjilo**
Hem sübhî-dir **božnik** hem baya derler **bogati**
- 15 **Prst** parmak **ruka** el-dir dahy **prsten**-dir yüzük
Uš bit-dir pire **buha** pire otu **paprat**
- 16 **Led** buz-dur su **voda**-dır diñ adı **Crkvina**
Sol tuz-dur **rič** söz-dür susa sen de **muči ti**
- 17 **Tazı hrt**-tır **vižle** zagar **kučka** derler kancığa
Miš sıçan-dir **pas** köpek-dir **zločest**-dir nekbeti
- 18 **Uči, piši, radi vrlo da ne budeš zločest**
Oku, yaz ve pekçe çalış, olmayasın nekbeti
- 19 **Fâ'ilâtün fâ'ilâtün fâ'ilâtün fâ'ilât**
Sana benzer hûb yok-tur nite nije nitko kani ti [6a-8a]

Part IX:

- 1 **İdi yürü! Hodi! Gele! sid'!** otur!
Ustani! Dur! ti donesi sen getir!
- 2 **Lasno** demek oldu kolay, **mučno** güç
Tara osovin', june tosun, hem **kotor**
- 3 De ağıla, buzağıya de **tele**
Ovca koyun, yuvlanan top **kotur**
- 4 **Tikva** kabak, **vino** şarap, hem **čaša**
De kadehe, sarhoşa hem **pjan** denir

- 5 *Yak! Užeži! hem çıraya de luč*
Şimdi sada, doč' će oti ol gelir
- 6 *Vatra, oganj ateşe de, plamen*
De yalına, ugljen-dir hem kölmür
- 7 *Yarasa hem kaşbaba-dyr klin çivi*
Muha sinek, kelebeğe der lepur
- 8 *Bahçeye hem vrtlo denir, luk soğan*
Frengede yakın bir şehre de Kotor
- 9 *Vrba söğüüt, ardıca hem liska der*
Tez hitnik, hem trpennik ne sabur
- 10 *Erteye hem sutra denir, dün jučer*
Hul'ja san, dahi dikil (i)stobor
- 11 *Haşhaşa mak, ripa de şalgama*
Hem çınara dahi denildi javor
- 12 *B(a)radva nacak, hem kesere tesla der*
Testereye pila denir, şator
- 13 *De çadıra, hem koliba çerga-dır*
Mantara, bil dahi, denildi peçur
- 14 *Hem govedar oldu çoban, taş kamen*
Köye selo, köyliye dendi potur
- 15 *(I)tkogodi dobro čini, nači će*
Her kişi-kim eylik eder, ol bulur
- 16 *Müfte 'ilün müfte 'ilün fâ 'ilün*
Halikunâ ya 'lemu mâ fi 's-sudûr [16b-18b]

Part XIII:

- 1 *Bir, iki, üç, jedno, (i)dvi, hem tri*
Dahi dörde dediler četiri
- 2 *Pet beş-tir, šest altı, hem yedi*
Bil, sedam-dır hem sekiz osam dedi
- 3 *De deved ile desed dahi on ile dokuz*
Dvadesed oldu yirmi, hem otuz
- 4 *Tridesed, dahi bil, četridesed*
Kırk, elli petdesed-dir, šestdesed
- 5 *Altmış ve yetmiş dahi sedamdesed*
Oldu seksen hem osamdesed
- 6 *Hem devedesed doksan oldu, (i)sto yüz*
Dahi (i)dvi stotine ikiyüz
- 7 *Oldu (i)tri stotine üçyüz*
De četiri (i)stotine dört yüz

- 8 *Dahi **pet stotina** beşyüz
Var kıyas et gayrılın, anlaya söz*
- 9 *Bin dahi **hiljad**-dır, hoş anla sen
Hem **desed hiljada** onbin, dinle sen*
- 10 *Dahi **izbroj!** Say! Demek-dir, dahi **loj**
Don yağıdır, ol bizim-dir dedi **moj***
- 11 *Hem **pretil**-dir semiz olan, **kopriva**
Oldu ısırgan, dahi yüzmek-dir **pliva***
- 12 *Dahi dövene der bosanca **(i)stupa**
Serhatta bir su var adı **Kupa***
- 13 ***Brk** bıyık, dahi **(i)brada** sakal
Ode gitti, **ostan**'! sen-de kal*
- 14 ***Rak** (y)engeç, **žaba**-dır hem kurbağa
Derler **(i)žbanj** ağaç olan ibriğa*
- 15 ***Kotlinica** oldu tem bil tencere
Badža **komin**, **pozorac**-dır pencere*
- 16 *Hem **makaš**-dır cüce, zindan **tavnica**
Dahi tan yıldızına de **danica***
- 17 *Tan yerine dedi **zor**, **magla** hem
De duman **dažd**, yağmur **brika** hem*
- 18 ***Puh** ve kuskun, **sedlo** eğer, hem kolan
Oldu **poprug**, **prdljaj!** var dolan!*
- 19 *Hem dilenci oldu **p(o)rosjak**, hem **sužanj**
Bil, esir-dir, bir şehir adı **Lužan***
- 20 ***Kozle** oğlak, **jagnje** kuzu, **jelina**
Geyiğe der, yeni gelin **gelina***
- 21 ***Pametan** hem akıla der, **mahnito**
Şaşkın olan, şunu kaldır! **digni to!***
- 22 *Soyu soppu güzel olan **plemenit**
Dahi evlenmek dediler **oženit***
- 23 *İsterim ben **hoću**, **neću** istemem
İšći! İste! **ja ne marim** hislemem*
- 24 *Tatlı şaraba dediler dahi **mast**
Hem yemek yer misin? **Hoć' jist'?***
- 25 *De fakire **siromah**, hem lahana
Oldu **kupus**, **(i)zdila** der sahana*
- 26 *Hem çanak kim olsa ağaç **kutao**
Der elem(e)ye adına hem **vitao***
- 27 ***Desno** sağ-dır dahi **livo** oldu sol*

Hem lahana turşu suyu-dur rasol

28 *Igla iğne, hem konac der ipliğe
Veze nakış (i)svila der ipeğe*

Fâ'ilâtün fâ'ilâtün fâ'ilün

29 *Şöyle bilsin nükte sencân-i kelâm
Oldu bin kırk-birde bu nüsha tamam [22a-25b]*

In fact, the method of learning through poetry was very popular in the past.***** The dictionaries, called Sıbha-i Sıbyan, were taught at school in primary level. These works were designed to enable little children to memorize the Arabian and Persian words easily. This method is widely used in our time as well. However, there are slight differences. For example, some songs are taught in nurseries and kinder gardens. The information is easy to keep in mind by the help of the songs. Once adopted into our own language, the tradition of dictionary in verse will be an effective method of language teaching.

Recommendations

The work can be useful to teach Turkish to Bosnian, Bosnian to Turkish once it is adapted to our day. In this regard, after examining the editions, a comparative version might be published. It can be used in language teaching after the necessary adaptations.

In reference to this work, poems and songs can be produced to be used in language teaching.

References

- Bademcioğlu, Şinasi (2009) Kurgusal Sözlük, Kelime Ezberleten 12 Tekrarlı, Alfa Yayınları, İstanbul
- Demircan, Ömer (2005) Yabancı Dil Öğretim Yöntemleri, Der Yayınları, İstanbul.
- Derviş, M.Korkut (1942) Makbûl-i Arif (Potur-Şâhidija), Sarajevo.
- Türkçe Sözlük (2005) (Haz. Komisyon), Türk Dil Kurumu Yayınları, Ankara.
- Mehmed Hevâî Üsküfî, Makbûl-i Ârif (Potur Şâhidî), Gazi Hüsrev Bey Kütüphanesi, R-2865.
- Mehmed Hevâî Üsküfî, Makbûl-i Ârif (Potur Şâhidî), Gazi Hüsrev Bey Kütüphanesi, R-6294.
- Mehmed Hevâî Üsküfî (2001) Maqbûl-i Arif (Potur Sahidiya), (Haz. Fehim NAMETAK), Tuzla Derviş Susiç Kütüphanesi Yayınları.
- Parlatır, İsmail (2009) Osmanlıca Türkçesi Sözlüğü, Yargı Yayınları, Ankara.
- Redhouse İngilizce-Türkçe / Türkçe-İngilizce Mini Sözlüğü, 2008.
- Üzgor, Tahir (1990) Türkçe Divan Dibaceleri, Kültür Bakanlığı Yayınları, Ankara.
- Okuyucu, Cihan (2006) Divan Edebiyatı Estetiği, L&M yayınları, İstanbul.
- Kırbiyık, Mehmet (2002) *Miftah-ı Lisan Adlı Manzum Fransızca-Türkçe Sözlük Üzerine*, Selçuk Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Enstitüsü Dergisi, Sayı 1, s.184-200.

***** *Tuhfe-i Vehbi*, written by İbrahim Şâhidî Dede, has 60 editions (Kırbiyık, 2002:183).

Okumuş, Sait (2009) *Muhammed Hevâi Üsküfi ve Türkçe-Boşnakça Manzum Sözlüğü Makbûl-i Arif*, Turkish Studies International Periodical For the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic Volume 4/4 Summer, s. 823-844.

İpekten, Haluk (2008) *Eski Türk Edebiyatı Nazım Şekilleri ve Aruz*, Dergah Yayınları, İstanbul.

Kılıç, Atabey (2006) *Manzum Sözlüklerimizden Sübhâ-i Sıbyân Şerhi "Hediyyetü'l-ihvân"* Turkish Studies International Periodical For the Languages, Literature and History of Turkish or Turkic Volume 1/1 Summer, s.13-23.